

Peningkatan Kualitas Pelayanan Akademik Pada Universitas Ibrahimy

**Improving the Quality of Academic Services at Ibrahimy
University**

Syahrul Ibad

Faculty of Social and Humanities Sciences, Universitas Ibrahimy

email:sinbad.sit@gmail.com

Abstrak

Penelitian ini didasarkan pada permasalahan Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 5 Tahun 1980 tentang Tugas dan Fungsi Universitas menyebutkan bahwa tugas pokok universitas/institute adalah menyelenggarakan pendidikan dan pengajaran di perguruan tinggi berdasarkan kebudayaan bangsa Indonesia. Hal tersebut dilakukan dengan cara ilmiah yang meliputi pendidikan dan pengajaran, penelitian, dan pengabdian pada masyarakat sesuai dengan peraturan perundang-undang yang berlaku. Penelitian difokuskan pada teori kualitas pelayanan publik melalui bagaimana peningkatan kualitas pelayanan administrasi akademik pada Universitas Ibrahimy. Metode penelitian digunakan adalah penelitian kualitatif dengan metode menggambarkan, merekonstruksi, dan menganalisis suatu hasil penelitian. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan peningkatan kualitas pelayanan akademik Universitas Ibrahimy dilakukan dengan cara: Pertama, perencanaan pelayanan akademik ditandai dengan dibentuknya tim, pengumpulan data, merumuskan Renstra, pembahasan Renstra, dan sosialisasi. Kedua, pengorganisasian pelayanan akademik ditandai dengan pembentukan unit organisasi, penempatan personil, dan penataan dokumen mutu. Ketiga, pelaksanaan pelayanan akademik ditandai dengan adanya pelayanan pembelajaran namun belum optimal, pelayanan bimbingan dan pelayanan perpustakaan yang sudah optimal. Keempat, pengawasan pelayanan akademik dilakukan dalam bentuk penilaian kinerja dosen oleh tim, khususnya dalam pembelajaran.

Kata Kunci: Peningkatan; Kualitas Pelayanan; Akademik

Abstract

This research is based on the issue of Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 5 of 1980 concerning Duties and Functions of Universities which states that the main task of universities/institutes is to provide education and teaching in universities based on the culture of the Indonesian nation. This is done in scientifically involving education and teaching, research, and community service in accordance with the applicable laws and regulations. The research focuses on the theory of public service quality through how to improve the quality of academic administration

services at Ibrahimy University. The research method used was qualitative research with the methods of describing, reconstructing, and analyzing the result of research. The results show that the improvement of academic service quality in Ibrahimy University was carried out in the following ways: Firstly, planning for academic services was marked by the formation of a team, data collection, formulation of strategic plans, discussion of strategic plans, and socialization; secondly, the organization of academic services is marked by the formation of organizational units, placement of personnel, and arrangement of quality documents; thirdly, the implementation of academic services is marked by the existence of learning services but not optimal, guidance services and library services that are already optimal; and fourthly, the supervision of academic services is carried out in the form of evaluating the performance of lecturers by the team, especially in learning.

Keywords: Improvement; Quality Service; Academic

Introduction

Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 5 of 1980 concerning the Duties and Functions of Universities states that the main task of universities/institutes is to provide education and teaching in universities based on the culture of the Indonesian nation. This is done scientifically involving education and teaching, research, and community service in accordance with the applicable laws and regulations. To carry out these main tasks, universities/institutes have the following functions: 1) to carry out the development of education and teaching; 2) to conduct research in the context of developing culture, especially science, technology, education and the arts; 3) carry out community service; 4) to organize the development of the academic community and their relationship with the environment; and 5) to carry out administrative activities.

Article 39 of Law no. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System states that education personnel are tasked with carrying out administration, processing, development, supervision, and technical services to support the education process in educational units. Furthermore, this regulation states that educational staffs are professionals who are in charge of planning and implementing the learning process, assessing learning outcomes, conducting guidance and training, as well as conducting research and community service, especially for educators at universities.

The implementation of academic administration is the implementation of service functions to students, the community, and stakeholders, namely how the resources available in universities are used as well as possible for the desired interests. In this framework to determine services, universities need to approach students, the community, and the stakeholders they serve. Students, society, and stakeholders in general still often complain about university employees who are less responsive and understanding to the needs of academic administration. To obtain simple services, students, communities, and

stakeholders are often faced with difficulties, such as complicated procedures in each service.

Muhammad (2013) said that university employees did not feel called to increase efficiency and improve work procedures. Higher education maintains the status quo, gives rise to the perception of students, society, and stakeholders that the service process is complicated, and the procedures are difficult and carried by personal interests. The management style that has been task-oriented also has the effect of not being motivated by employees on the results and the quality of public services.

Universities have not been able to carry out service administration functions properly. This is influenced by various factors. Firstly, students, community, and stakeholders themselves cannot access information easily in higher education, especially with regard to the role and function of higher education and its programs. Secondly, students, communities, and stakeholders deal with the university reluctantly. This is due to inadequate of knowledge among students, society, and stakeholders on the role and function of university, ignorance about the program, and ignorance about their needs related to the university.

In providing services to students, communities, and stakeholders, universities are seen as less aspirational, less responsive, less accountable, and other negative views that lead to low public trust in village government officials. Meanwhile, students, community, and stakeholders may not refuse to have a relationship with the university as an educational organization. Criticism of students, society, and stakeholders generally leads to the assessment that university officials are not able to carry out their duties properly. This critical attitude of students, community, and stakeholders is getting stronger along with the emergence of suspicion, social jealousy, horizontal conflicts, and protests from students, community, and stakeholders towards academic administration services.

A successful service based on the satisfaction of people who need services can be interpreted by comparing the views between the received services and the perceived service. In the context of public service, it is stated that public service is prioritizing the public interest, facilitating public affairs, shortening the time to carry out public affairs and to satisfy the public.

University is an educational institution in charge of managing education in higher education which also provides services to students, community, and stakeholders in the terms of academic administration and student admissions. The process of improving service quality continues to be carried out starting from Tangibles, Reliability, Responsiveness, Assurance, and Empathy (Fandy, 2000). Ibrahimy University itself has experienced improvements since the transition to the new government. Improvement after improvement, development after development began to appear at Ibrahimy University.

This can be seen in the appearance of Ibrahimy University, its reliability, and responsiveness as a service center at the University which has been increasing both in terms of facilities and human resources. Therefore, by looking at this, researchers are interested in investigating more deeply how to improve the quality of academic administration services at Ibrahimy University.

Methods

This study focuses on the theory of the quality of public services through how to improve the quality of academic administration services at Ibrahimy University through plans that are carried out, university steps to build the vision and mission of the organization, to set up strategic goals and to design strategies to achieve goals. So this research focuses on: Tangible or physical evidence of service; Reliability, or service reliability; Responsiveness, or service response; Assurance or guarantee and certainty of service; and Empathy, providing service attention.

The research method used was qualitative research, according to Miles, Huberman and Saldana (2014: 19) defining descriptive research as a method used to describe or analyze a research result but not used to make broad conclusions. Data was collected through interviews, observation and documentation. Meanwhile, in qualitative data analysis, there are three flow activities following the steps of data condensation (Data Condensation), data presentation (Data Display), and drawing conclusions (Conclusion Drawing/Verification) in order to answer research problems.

Results and Discussion

Academic Service

Public service can be interpreted as an effort made by a person or group of people or certain institutions to provide convenience and assistance to the community in the context of certain goals. Services must be oriented to the interests of the people and social justice. In order to reach all levels of society fairly, services must be carried out non-discriminatory, transparent, objective and firm ways (Homaidi and Ibad, 2019). Dwiyanto suggests four criteria that can be used to assess the performance of the bureaucracy in providing public services: Public Accountability, Responsiveness, Service Orientation, and Service Efficiency (Agus, 2006).

Based on students' rights related to services provided to students as external customers, according to Mahmud (2012), they are grouped broadly as follows:

- a. Information services are the ones provided in oral or written form, which can be received through direct or face-to-face contact as well as written information through various manuals, academic guidelines, field work practice guidelines, banners, brochures, wall magazines, or through social media such as Facebook, Whatsapp.
- b. Facilities and infrastructure services are the provision of services in the form of providing infrastructure or physical facilities provided by universities, starting with lecture rooms, supporting facilities, parking lots, open spaces, Educational Journals, laboratories, and teaching support tools such as projectors, LCDs, air conditioning and lecture hall loans, learning support loans, such as markers, power cables, projectors, and HDMI cable ports.
- c. Academic services, which are correspondence services that are usually needed by students, such as student certificates which are usually used for applying for scholarships, applying for pension benefits, certificates of study leave, application letters for field work practices, real work lecture letters, extension of study period, submission of titles thesis and appointment of supervisors, pre-transcript printing services, arrangement of lecture schedules.
- d. Academic and academic guidance services begin with the orientation of the introduction of studies and alma mater intended for new students, students are guided by Academic Advisory Lecturers (PA) during the lecture period including the preparation of study plans, determining courses, overcoming student academic problems, monitoring students related to filling out KRS improvements KRS, monitors student academic progress, holds regular meetings at least once in each semester.
- e. Student welfare services, namely the provision of scholarships to outstanding students, especially from the underprivileged, as well as the granting of UKT waivers.

Quality of Public Service

Quality means quality. The definition of quality can vary depending on who is using it from an individual's point of view. Quality is a word that for service providers is something that must be done well (Eka, 2012).

Quality is, according to Kotler, all the characteristics and characteristics of a product or service that affect the ability of satisfying the stated or implied needs. Meanwhile, according to Goetsch and Davis as quoted in Fandy Tjiptono, quality is a dynamic condition associated with products, services, people, processes, and the environment that meets or exceeds expectations. So, it can be concluded that quality is a business or strategy that produces goods or services that meet the needs and satisfaction of the community.

To provide services that satisfy service users, service delivery must meet service principles. To achieve this satisfaction, professional quality of public services is required. Then Litjan Poltak Sinambela, et al suggested the principles in public services are reflected in: Transparency, Accountability, Conditional, Participatory, Equality of Rights, Balance of Rights and Obligations (Litjan, 2011).

The principles of providing public services are also regulated in Article 4 of Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services consisting of 12 principles: the principle of public interest, the principle of legal certainty, the principle of equality of rights, the balance of rights and obligations, the principle of professionalism, the principle of participation, the principle of equal/non-discriminatory treatment, the principle of openness, the principle of accountability, the principle of facilities and special treatment for vulnerable groups, the principle of timeliness, the principle of speed, convenience, and affordability.

Based on the understanding above, public services will be qualified if they fulfill the following principles: transparency, accountability, participation, equality of rights, balance of rights and obligations, professionalism, facilities, timeliness and convenience.

Providing good service is one of the company's efforts to create satisfaction for its customers. When consumers feel they have received good service, it means that the company is able to provide good service as well. Otherwise, service cannot be described objectively like a product, but is a social interaction with subjectivity, more dependent on values, feelings and behavior.

Wyckcof and Lovelock in a book quoted and translated by Fandy Tjiptono state that there are two main factors affecting service quality: expected and perceived services. If the service received or perceived (perceived service) is as expected, then the service quality is perceived as an ideal quality. Conversely, if the service received is lower than expected, the perceived service quality is poor. Whether or not the quality of services is good depends on the ability of service providers to consistently meet customer expectations (Fandy, 2000).

So the quality of service is determined not only by those who serve, but also by those who want to be satisfied. And the principles of quality service according to H.A.S. Moenir (2002), among others:

- a. Processes and procedures should be established in advance.
- b. The processes and procedures must be known by all parties involved.
- c. Discipline for implementation to comply with processes and procedures
- d. It is necessary to review processes and procedures by the leadership, which can be changed at any time if necessary.
- e. It is necessary to create conducive climate for the developers of organizational culture to create quality services.

- f. Quality means meeting the wants, needs, tastes of consumers.
- g. Everyone in the organization is a partner with everyone else

In the implementation of public services, attention must be paid to the supporting aspects so that services can run well. Factors to be considered include: awareness factors both from service officers and from the community; regulatory factors that have been determined by the service provider agency; good organizational factors; reward or salary factor; working ability factor; facilities and infrastructure factors; communication and education.

Parasuraman et al in Fandy Tjiptono (2000) suggest several criteria underlying the consumers' assessment of services:

- a. Tangible or physical evidence, the ability to show its existence to external parties. It means that the appearance and capabilities of physical facilities and infrastructure and the condition of the surrounding environment are tangible evidence of the services provided.
- b. Reliability, the ability to provide services as promised accurately and reliably.
- c. Responsiveness or response is a willingness to help and provide fast and appropriate service to the community by conveying clear information.
- d. Assurance and certainty is the knowledge, courtesy, and ability of employees to foster trust in customers. It consists of several components: communication, credibility, security, competence and courtesy.
- e. Empathy is to give sincere and or personal attention to customers by trying to understand customer's desires.

Efforts to Improve Academic Services at Ibrahimy University

The efforts to improve the academic services of Ibrahimy University can be seen from the planning of higher education academic services carried out by taking the following strategic steps:

Firstly, planning through team formation, data collection (diagnosis), formulation of Statutes, Strategic Plan (laying of philosophical foundations, formulation of vision and mission, goals and values, situation analysis, formulation of strategic policies, formulation of long-term development plans, formulation of financing strategies, and formulation of strategic control), discussion, and socialization.

Secondly, the organization of academic services as stated in the findings section is marked by the formation of organizations/work units assigned to implement, evaluate, and improve the implementation of academic services. This is followed by the placement of personnel who are considered capable and competent to carry out the task. The units or institutions/agencies that are established will then formulate quality documents, such as

Academic Manuals, Academic Standards, Academic Policies, Quality Manuals, and Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) both at University and Faculty levels.

The placement of personnel in units/institutions that generally consider the capability aspect shows the seriousness of the formulation and determination of quality documents, such as quality manuals, quality policies, quality standards, standard operating procedures (SOP), and others, indicating the institution's desire to make rules of the game that can be guided together and create a system that supports the improvement of service quality as well.

Thirdly, the implementation of academic services is marked by the existence of learning services. In the aspect of academic guidance services, it is a service that contains not only elements of knowledge enrichment, but also psychological services to increase motivation for achievement. Findings in the field related to administrative guidance and counseling indicate that this service has not run optimally due to factors, both rules that are not followed by sanctions, as well as the motivation and commitment of the supervisors. Field findings related to the ineffectiveness of thesis guidance services are closely related to lecturers' mastery of research methodologies, commitment to carry out their duties as supervisors to the fullest, and aspect of equity. Meanwhile, a study on library services found that university services were very qualified in terms of the physical buildings and other physical features. Likewise, the collection of books continues to increase, both titles and samples. However, the findings in the field indicate that the ever-increasing collection of books is not fully in line with the needs of students in each department/study program, so that its existence has not contributed maximally to increasing students' knowledge of a subject.

Viewed from the practical service aspect, it is an academic service aimed at improving students' psychomotor skills on a subject. The results of study show that practical services concentrated in the laboratory are faced with some problems related to human resources (lecturers), facilities, and practical work systems.

The results of study on improving academic services at universities found that the supervision of the quality of academic services at the department level on the learning process was carried out in the form of controlling lecture recordings/attendance lists of lecturers and students and assessing the competence of lecturers by students.

Planning is essentially a forward-looking activity. Findings in the field indicate that prior to the formulation of strategic plans, universities have the same tradition of forming teams consisting of experts and faculty representatives who are mandated to prepare strategic plans for the next 5-10 years. Judging from the working model, the Strategic Planning Team can be categorized into a type of task team (Lewis and Smith, 1994: 193-194),

consisting of people from one or more functional areas, established to address a particular problem or number of problems, problem and then disbanded. The members of this team are selected based on their background and experience. The membership and tasks are assigned by the management. Terry and Leslie (2010) stated that an effective management implementation is also influenced by the presence or absence of a team implementation in management.

In the management of an organization or organized activity, the determination of quality is a very important effort because the quality of performance often determines the continuity of the organization or activity concerned. Determination of quality is a difficult thing. This is partly due to: (a) quality is a subjective evaluation concept because it is always influenced by attitude factors; (2) quality is a function of the basic aims and objectives of the organization or activity concerned. The structure is, according to Anderson (1972), an arrangement in the form of a framework that gives shape and appearance, so that the working procedure will be seen. In governmental organizations, a procedure is a predetermined set of actions that must be passed to carry out a task.

Meanwhile, in another concept it is said that organizational structure can also be interpreted as a relationship of characteristics, norms and patterns of relationships that occur within executive bodies that have a potential or real relationship with what they have in carrying out policies (Ibad and Lolita, 2020). This understanding is in line with Robbins (1995) stating that the organizational structure determines how tasks will be divided, who reports to whom, formal coordination mechanisms and patterns of interaction that will be followed. The results of study indicate that the organization of academic services at universities is marked by the formation of a number of organizational units to support the implementation of service quality, especially academics. Based on a reading of the organizational structure of higher education, it can be categorized into a functional structure. In an organization using a functional structure, activities at all levels are grouped in such a way that those with the same function are collected in one section, for example, the library's Technical Implementation Unit only deals with library problems. The functional structure is suitable for organizations with major problems or goals requiring functional expertise, efficiency, and good quality work. A section will be efficient and able to work with good quality, if the section only handles one type of activity.

The functional structure makes cooperation within the division good, because employees will have similar values, goals, and orientations. However, this advantage is accompanied by difficulties in cooperating and coordinating with other divisions or functions. This difficulty arises because each section tends to pay attention only to the activities within the section itself, regardless the coordination with other sections. This condition is found in the

three universities, where each organizational unit is busy with their own work regardless the coordination with other units; the implication is that overlapping of work becomes common. The structure and flow of activities in the organization, according to Thompson, J.D (1967:67), will be influenced by the interdependence between tasks. Therefore, this property can be used to design the form or internal structure of the organization, adapted to the pattern of the flow of activities and the interdependence of tasks occurring in the flow of activities.

In higher education activities with a very high level of interdependence between sections, the coordination techniques that can be used are horizontal communication and joint adjustment. The implementation of higher education academic services can be seen from three aspects: firstly, the quality of learning services consisting of the quality of content/teaching materials, the quality of teaching preparation, the quality of the process, and the quality of evaluation; secondly, the quality of academic guidance services; thirdly, the quality of the library; and fourthly, the quality of the practical works. The quality of learning services can be seen in three components, namely aspects of content/teaching materials, quality of teaching preparation, quality of process, and quality of evaluation. The aspect of the quality of content/teaching materials includes courses, lecture materials, and source books.

The discussion of the implementation of academic services in this section uses indicators of academic service quality, including tangible, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. The five indicators are contextualized in the quality of academic services into six indicators, including tangible, competent, attitude, content, delivery, and reliability dimensions. The six indicators are not discussed one by one but are discussed simultaneously in presenting the quality of content, preparation, process, and evaluation of learning. Studies on the quality of academic/learning services show that the quality of lecture content is influenced not only by the managerial aspects of the institution but also by the manager's perspective in perceiving nature/world (world view), thus affecting the formulation of the curriculum (content) of learning. It was found that the curriculum formulation which is the core service of higher education in research settings still does not have a philosophical basis on which to act. A number of courses at the two universities, especially in the majors in higher education, were found to be independent, dichotomous, and not integrated yet into a single context based on the monotheistic principle of science. Fourthly, in relation to the supervision of the quality of academic services (reliability aspect), it was found that there are elements of subjectivity and imbalance in the assessment aspect, weak evaluation validity, still thick in evaluation of the learning process. Quality evaluation services can at least be seen from the criteria offered by Brady (1990: 142)

including; "objectivity, diagnostic values, and participation". The objectivity criteria indicate that the evaluation must be based on objective measurements as opposed to subjectivity, the diagnostic value criteria require the evaluations differentiate the students' achievement levels, and the participation criteria require the evaluation procedure to involve students.

In relation to quality and quality, there are six value systems becoming references in life. Philosophical foundation in the context of academic service quality management must also be seen in the framework of logical values, ethical values, and aesthetic values. Logical value in the practice of quality education management becomes the foundation in the managerial process based on rational and technological values. Managerial practice is carried out by prioritizing the common sense aspect, empowering the aspect ratio of employees/academic staff and responding to the development of science and technology. Meanwhile, the content of academic services and the process of presenting services (learning) must guide students to have high order thinking skills by prioritizing discovery-based learning.

The ethical values in building quality management underlie the empowerment of employees/staffs. Humans should be viewed as a goal rather than a means to an end. Managerial actions must be carried out by prioritizing universally shared values, such as honesty, politeness, justice, equality, sincerity, tolerance, and compassion values. Academic services should teach students these universal values and how to implement them in accordance with the value creator, the creator of the universe.

Aesthetic values are the foundation to see managerial work as a job that has artistic/beauty value, an art to achieve organizational goals. Aesthetic values in academic services (learning) are realized by increasing the aesthetic perceptions of students (students) in order to find the increased meaning in all aspects of life. Aesthetic values also help educators (lecturers) increase their effectiveness. Teaching, constituting a form of artistic expression, can be judged according to artistic standards of beauty and quality. Educator is an artist who strives to improve his performance continuously.

Teleological values are the basis for service quality management to see the principle of benefit and the skills to improve the quality of academic services for the people's **benefit** while still complying with applicable rules and norms and not justifying everything, as utilitarianism flows. The potentials and strengths stated here are the internal potentials and strengths of the institution that can be a driving force for the institution to survive in providing quality academic services to students as the users of educational services.

Conclusions

Efforts to improve the quality of academic services at Ibrahimy University can be carried out in several ways: firstly, planning for academic services marked by forming a team, collecting data, formulating strategic plans, discussing strategic plans, and socializing; secondly, the organization of academic services marked by the formation of organizational units, placement of personnel, and arrangement of quality documents; thirdly, the implementation of academic services marked by the existence of learning services but not optimal, guidance services and library services that are already optimal; and fourthly, the supervision of academic services carried out in the form of evaluating the performance of lecturers by the team, especially in learning.

The factors supporting the process of improving the quality of academic services in universities are: the existence of an evaluation of the lecture process, a good evaluation of the performance of lecturers, the facilitation of interaction between lecturers on campus, and the existence of a democratic leader. Meanwhile, the obstacles faced by universities include: non-optimal resources, facilities and infrastructure still in improving and developing process, limited facilities and their non-optimal utilization, human resources not mastering the use of international standard facilities such as IT/ICT networks in the teaching and learning process, still needing development and operational training in the use of the technology, incomprehensive socialization and still verbal technical matters, dialogue about regulations and policies and work procedures unclear and less understandable to the entire higher education community.

References

- Agus, Dwiyanto. (2006). *Reformasi Birokrasi Publik*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Anderson, Kenneth E.. (1972). *Introduction to Communication Theory and Practice*. Philippines: Cumming Publ Company.
- Brady, N.C. (1990). *The Nature and Properties of Soils*. 10th ed. Macmillan Publ. Com., New York.
- Eka, Suhartini. (2012). *Kualitas Pelayanan Kaitannya dengan Kepuasan Konsumen*. Makassar: Alauddin Press University.
- Fandy, Tjiptono. (2000). *Manajemen Pemasaran*. Yogyakarta: Andi Offset.
- Homaidi, A. and Ibad, S. (2019). *Improving the Quality of Public Complaints Services in Realizing Good Governance in Bondowoso District Inspectorate*. J. Public Adm. and Gov. 9 (3), 200-209. doi: 10.5296/jpag.v9i3.15250.
- H. A. S, Moenir. (2002). *Manajemen Pelayanan Umum di Indonesia*, Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.

- Ibad, S., & Lolita, YW,. (2020). *Pengembangan Pelayanan Publik Melalui E-Government (Studi Pada Layanan Smartcity Kabupaten Situbondo)*. Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik 6 (2), 200-226. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.26618/kjap.v6i2.3944>
- Lewis, Ralph G dan Smith, Douglas H. (1994). *Total Quality in Higher Education*. Florida: St Lucie Press, Florida.
- Litjan Poltak Sinambela, dkk. (2011). *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik Teori, Kebijakan, Implementasi*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Mahmud, Marzuki. (2012). *Manajemen Mutu Perguruan Tinggi*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Miles, M.B, Huberman Dan Saldana. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourcebook*. ed. 3. USA: Sage Publication.
- Muhammad, Ramli. (2013). *Manajemen Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Kemanusiaan*. Makassar: Alauddin University Press.
- R. Terry, George dan Leslie W.Rue. (2010). *Dasar-Dasar Manajemen*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Robbins, Stephen P., (1995). *Perilaku Organisasi Alih Bahasa Hedayana Pujaatmaka*. Jakarta: Prenhalindo.
- Thompson, J.D. (1967). *Organizations in Action*. McGraw-Hill: New York, NY.