|  |
| --- |
| **Enhancing Quality of Guidance and Counseling in Vocational Schools: Testing CIPP Evaluation Model Effectiveness for Counseling Programs** |
| Muhammad Andri Setiawan1\*, Nina Permata Sari2, Eklys Cheseda Makaria3,  Najwa Shabrina Dinanty4, Gazali Rahman5  1 Muhammad Andri Setiawan, Program Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia.  2 Nina Permata Sari, Program Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia.  3 Eklys Cheseda Makaria, Program Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia.  4 Najwa Shabrina Dinanty, Program Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia.  5 Gazali Rahman, Program Studi Bimbingan dan Konseling, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia.  \*Corresponding Author Email: andri.bk@ulm.ac.id |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Article history**  Received:  Revised:  Accepted:  Published:  DOI:  © 2022 The Authors. This open-access article is distributed under a CC BY-SA 4.0 DEED License  **Publisher**  **UPT Mataram University Press**  Creative Commons License | **Abstract:** This study assesses the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model's effectiveness in evaluating guidance and counseling programs within the merdeka curriculum of Vocational High Schools. Collaborating with three experts—guidance and counseling specialists, educational technology experts, and practitioner teachers—the research employs assessment tests and pre-test/post-test questionnaires for 10 Guidance and Counseling Teachers at Vocational High School 3 Banjarmasin. Evaluation results, covering general, specific, and material aspects, show a high level of agreement among the three evaluators. General evaluation exhibits very high reliability (ICC = 0.750), and specific and material evaluations demonstrate high reliability with ICC values of 0.794 each. The trial on 10 Guidance and Counseling Teachers reveals a significant improvement in their evaluation skills after implementing the CIPP model. Average post-test results are notably higher than pre-test, highlighting the positive impact of the CIPP evaluation model on enhancing these skills. The research concludes that the CIPP evaluation model is reliable and consistent in measuring guidance and counseling program effectiveness in the merdeka curriculum of Vocational High Schools. Empirical and theoretical support establishes a strong foundation for considering future implementation of the CIPP model in educational program evaluations. This model's application is anticipated to elevate the quality and relevance of educational programs, particularly in the context of guidance and counseling in Vocational High Schools, with potential practical and managerial benefits.  **Keywords:** *Counseling Program, Guidance and Counseling Teachers, CIPP Evaluation Model, Vocational High School, Expert Validation*. |
| **How to cite:** Mulyani, S., Elfi, S. VH., Ariani, S. R. D., Utomo, S. B., Kharolinasari, R., & Panie, M. Y. (2022). Multiple Representation-Based Blended Learning Model for Chemistry Learning in High School. *PAEDAGOGIA*, *25*(1), 55-64. doi: 10.20961/paedagogia.v25i1.56298 | |

**INTRODUCTION**

The burning issues in modern education present significant challenges, and the improvement of guidance and counseling quality in Vocational High Schools is an urgent necessity. The counseling program plays a strategic role in assisting students in developing their potential, overcoming academic obstacles, and achieving success in the world of work (Rapanta et al., 2020). In an effort to ensure that every student receives appropriate and relevant support for future success, it is essential to enhance the effectiveness of counseling programs in Vocational High Schools.

Berman et al., (2018) affirm that effective guidance and counseling practices provide a foundation for how students learn, considering social, emotional, and academic aspects. (Strayhorn, 2018) emphasizes the importance of students' sense of belonging as a key to educational success, while Wyner, (2014) underscores the role of the college community in preparing all students for success. This approach aligns with (Darling-Hammond & Cook-Harvey, n.d.) view of holistic education supporting students' social, emotional, and academic development. van der Zanden et al., (2018) also indicate that understanding the domains and factors predicting student success can guide improvements in educational programs. Therefore, by enhancing the effectiveness of counseling programs in Vocational High Schools, an educational environment supporting the comprehensive development of students in line with contemporary demands can be achieved.

In response to the pandemic, O’Doherty et al., (2018) highlight challenges and solutions in online education, providing insights that can be adopted to enhance access and the quality of guidance and counseling in the Vocational High Schools educational environment. By referring to this raport, concrete steps can be taken to enrich counseling programs in Vocational High Schools, making them more responsive to the complex needs of students in achieving future success.

Concrete steps must be taken to improve the quality of guidance and counseling in Vocational High Schools. The main focus of this research is to test the effectiveness of the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model in measuring and improving the effectiveness of counseling programs in the Vocational High Schools environment. This research aims to evaluate the extent to which the CIPP evaluation model can be an alternative tool in enhancing the quality of guidance and counseling in Vocational High Schools. This developed model is designed to investigate the Context of the program, the Input provided, the Process implemented, and the Product outcomes. By conducting effectiveness tests on this model, this research seeks to identify potential areas for improvement and development of counseling programs in Vocational High Schools.

Sugiyo (2018) explores the CIPP evaluation model in guidance and counseling services at Senior High Schools. This research provides a foundation for the application of the CIPP evaluation model at the secondary education level, and these findings can be applied in the Vocational High Schools context. Additionally, research by Shu et al. (2023) discusses the application of the CIPP model in measuring the effectiveness of career development courses and job counseling. These findings can provide insights into the use of the CIPP model to enhance counseling programs in Vocational High Schools with a focus on career preparation for students.

Riyad et al. (n.d.) involve the CIPP model in measuring the professionalism of teacher performance. Although this research focuses on teachers, the approach and findings of the CIPP model can be applied analogously to enhance the quality of guidance and counseling services in Vocational High Schools. Iqbal et al. (2021) conduct a comparative analysis of the efficacy of three program evaluation models, including the CIPP model, providing a basis for understanding the strengths and weaknesses of each model, which can guide this research. Mujiyati et al. (2020) provide a comparison of accountability models in school counseling programs, offering additional insights related to improving the quality of guidance and counseling in Vocational High Schools. Through in-depth raport review, this research attempts to approach the CIPP evaluation framework with the unique context and challenges of Vocational High Schools. These studies provide a strong foundation for further research in the effort to enhance the effectiveness of counseling programs in Vocational High Schools.

Therefore, the contribution of this research is not only academic but also has direct implications for improving guidance and counseling practices in Vocational High Schools. By understanding the extent to which the CIPP evaluation model is formulated and then used as an effective tool, we can design and implement more targeted interventions, improve the quality of guidance and counseling services, and consequently enhance the achievement and success of students in Vocational High Schools.

The research by Sugiyo (2018) provides a foundation for the use of the CIPP evaluation model in guidance and counseling services at Senior High Schools. The implications of this research can be directly applied in the Vocational High Schools context, helping to design effective evaluation strategies. Finney’s, (2019) study on the confirmatory CIPP evaluation model can provide an additional perspective on this research, enriching the understanding of the effectiveness of the CIPP model. Similarly, research by Birgili & Kırkıç (2021) and Doufexi & Pampouri (2022) on the evaluation of management and professional training programs can offer valuable insights into applying the CIPP model in Vocational High Schools.

In conclusion, this research seeks to explore the effectiveness of the CIPP evaluation model in measuring and improving the quality of guidance and counseling programs in Vocational High Schools. The unique challenges and contexts of Vocational High Schools require a targeted and evidence-based approach to enhance the effectiveness of guidance and counseling services. By examining and testing the CIPP model within the specific context of Vocational High Schools, this research aims to provide actionable insights for policymakers, educators, and practitioners to improve the counseling programs, ultimately contributing to the success and development of students in Vocational High Schools.

**METHOD**

The research method aims to examine the agreement among three experts: a guidance and counseling expert, an educational technology expert, and a practitioner who is a guidance and counseling teacher leader. This pertains to the overall, specific, and material assessments in the CIPP evaluation model for counseling programs in the merdeka curriculumat the Vocational High School level.

**Sample, Target Population, and Research Context**

This study involves three experts as samples, namely guidance and counseling experts, educational technology experts, and practitioners of counseling teacher advocates, originating from both higher education institutions and school teacher practitioners. The target population is the counseling program within the merdeka curriculumat the vocational high school level. The research is conducted by testing the CIPP evaluation model on general, specific, material, and blueprint assessment aspects.

**Respondent Profile**

The main respondents in this study are 3 (three) experts, namely a guidance and counseling expert, an educational technology expert, and a practicing teacher who is also a guidance and counseling advocate. Additionally, 10 vocational high school counselors from Vocational High School 3 Banjarmasin are also respondents for piloting the evaluation model.

**Data Collection Methods**

The data were collected through assessment tests by three experts using the Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC) formula with SPSS 29 software application. Additionally, pre-test and post-test questionnaires were administered to 10 vocational high school counselors from Vocational High School 3 Banjarmasin.

The research instrument used in this study is an assessment instrument by experts in educational research and evaluation, guidance and counseling experts, guidance and counseling teachers, and subject teachers. This instrument is designed to measure aspects of CIPP model-based evaluation, including clarity, sufficiency, and appropriateness of the evaluation, consisting of general assessment aspects, specific assessment aspects, and material assessment aspects of the model.

Presented in **Table 1** are the assessment instruments for the feasibility of the counseling program module.

**Table 1.** Feasibility Assessment Instruments for the Evaluation Model

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **No.** | **Aspects of Assessment** |
|
| **No.** | **General Assessment Aspects** |
| 1 | Clarity of the evaluation concept context input process product counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 2 | Rationality clarity of the evaluation concept context input process product counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 3 | Clear profile of counseling program in the Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational school level |
| 4 | Clarity of the measured components of the CIPP model counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 5 | Clarity of the measured aspects of the CIPP evaluation model counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 6 | Clarity of the success criteria measured by the CIPP evaluation model counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 7 | Completeness of content |
| 8 | Evaluation instruments used |
| **No.** | **Special Assessment Aspects** |
| 1 | Clear instructions for evaluation preparation |
| 2 | Clear instructions for implementing each component assessment based on success criteria |
| 3 | Relevance of the evaluation model material with the content of the counseling program Merdeka Curriculum |
| 4 | Accuracy of the chosen evaluation model design CIPP evaluation model |
| 5 | Relevance of the instruments used to determine program success |
| **No.** | **Module Material Assessment Aspects** |
| 1 | Usefulness of the evaluation model for teachers |
| 2 | Accuracy in choosing the evaluation model with the program |
| 3 | Clarity of the instructions for completing the instrument sheets |
| 4 | Relevance of the material of the evaluation model with the counseling program Merdeka Curriculum at the vocational high school level |
| 5 | Operationality of the evaluation implementation instructions using the CIPP evaluation model |

**Measurement Procedure**

The measurement is conducted by analyzing the results of general, specific, and material assessment tests using the Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC). Reliability categories are determined based on ICC values, where values > 0.75 are considered highly reliable. Additionally, for pre-test and post-test questionnaire results, the paired sample T-test formula is employed to measure significant differences.

**RESULTAND DISCUSSION**

The general assessment of the evaluation model showed a high level of agreement among the three experts, including guidance and counseling experts, educational technology experts, and counseling teacher advocates. This evaluation encompassed general, specific, and material assessments of the CIPP evaluation model for counseling programs in the context of the merdeka curriculum at the vocational high school level. The researcher utilized interrater reliability testing using the Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC) formula to assess the reliability between the three raters. The ICC values were analyzed using the SPSS version 29 software. Following Fleiss' classification, the reliability levels are presented in **Table 2**:

**Table 2.** ICC Values and Classification

| **ICC Value** | **Classification** |
| --- | --- |
| <0,40 | Less Reliable |
| 0,40-0,75 | Reliable |

The results of the general assessment by three experts, namely guidance and counseling experts, educational technology experts, and counseling teacher advocates, indicated a high level of agreement with an ICC value of 0.750 for the average measures. This suggests highly reliable reliability. The findings imply that the CIPP evaluation model for counseling programs in the merdeka curriculum at the vocational high school level, specifically regarding general assessments of clarity in concepts, rationale, profile, components, aspects, success criteria, completeness of content, and the use of assessment instruments, is very accurate and suitable (Arjaya & Suma, 2023).

Several studies support these findings, emphasizing the importance of competency-based approaches in higher education curriculum development (Kang et al., 2022; Kapur, 2018). Additionally, research by Pujiastuti et al. (2021) evaluated thematic learning during the pandemic using the CIPP model. (Sankaran & Saad (2022) evaluated undergraduate education programs using the CIPP model, providing comprehensive insights into the success of the program.

Furthermore, the results of the specific assessment showed a high level of agreement, with an ICC value of 0.794 for average measures. This indicates that the evaluation model is highly accurate and suitable for assessing the clarity of preparation instructions, implementation instructions, material suitability, design accuracy, and the suitability of instruments used to determine program success. Several studies have identified key factors influencing educational program evaluation, supporting the validity of these results.

Moreover, the material assessment results from the evaluation model also achieved similar results with an ICC value of 0.794 for average measures. This conclusion indicates high agreement among the three assessors regarding the usefulness, accuracy of the evaluation model with the program, clarity of instructions, material suitability, and the operationality of evaluation implementation instructions. This finding supports the validity of the CIPP evaluation model in measuring key aspects of a program.

The assessment of the accuracy of the evaluation model, as conducted by three experts, resulted in an ICC value of 0.515 for average measures. Although this value is slightly lower, it still falls within the reliable category based on the proposed classification. The conclusion drawn is that the CIPP evaluation model for counseling programs in the merdeka curriculum at the vocational high school level, especially in terms of general, specific, and material assessments, has proven to be highly suitable for the achievement indicators.

Several studies have supported the success of the CIPP evaluation model in educational contexts. Arjaya & Suma (2023) analyzed issues of biology learning and evaluation in higher education based on the CIPP model. Barber et al. (2020) discussed the social accountability framework and its implications for medical education and program evaluation. Bolton-King (2022) evaluated student mentoring to enhance their engagement potential in the workforce. Bennett & McWhorter (2021) investigated the role of virtual human resource development in crisis and post-pandemic situations.

In summary, the findings of this study provide both empirical and theoretical support for the CIPP evaluation model across various educational contexts. Although the ICC value in your blueprint test indicates slightly lower reliability, the CIPP evaluation model is still accepted and considered suitable for achievement indicators in counseling programs in the merdeka curriculum at the vocational high school level.

In this research, a pre-test and post-test questionnaire was administered to 10 guidance and counseling teachers at Vocational High School 3 Banjarmasin to evaluate the impact of using the CIPP evaluation model on improving their skills in evaluating counseling programs. The research results show a significant increase in their skill levels after using the CIPP evaluation model. The post-test results were significantly higher than the pre-test results, and statistical analysis indicated a significant difference. This improvement in skills can be interpreted as a positive outcome of implementing the CIPP evaluation model. The mean scores increased from 20.6 in the pre-test to 70.2 in the post-test, indicating a substantial positive effect. This aligns with existing research demonstrating the effectiveness of the CIPP model in educational contexts (Arjaya & Suma, 2023; Sankaran & Saad, 2022). These findings align with previous research highlighting the effectiveness of the CIPP evaluation model in educational and professional development contexts, particularly in enhancing the skills of teachers or counselors.

The study by (Finney, 2019, 2020) emphasizes the importance of Confirmative Evaluation as a CIPP model that can provide a deep understanding of program effectiveness. Additionally, research by Pujiastuti et al. (2021), evaluating thematic learning during the pandemic, also adopted the CIPP model and reported positive outcomes. This suggests that the CIPP model can be adaptable across various educational contexts.

This research contributes to the existing body of knowledge by demonstrating the effectiveness of the CIPP evaluation model in enhancing the skills of guidance and counseling teachers in evaluating their programs. The positive results suggest that incorporating the CIPP model into training programs for guidance and counseling teachers can be a valuable strategy for improving their evaluation skills.

**CONCLUSION**

The findings of this research offer compelling evidence supporting the efficacy and reliability of the CIPP evaluation model within the realm of vocational high school counseling programs. The notable consensus among the three expert raters in the assessments—covering general, specific, and material aspects, as well as the overall evaluation—underscores the model's aptness in evaluating program clarity, specificity, and material components.

Moreover, the study sheds light on the positive influence of implementing the CIPP evaluation model on the skills of guidance and counseling teachers in assessing their programs. The substantial enhancement observed in post-test scores compared to pre-test scores implies that the CIPP model serves as a valuable tool for the professional development of guidance and counseling educators.

While the results present promising insights, it is imperative to acknowledge the need for further research, preferably with a more extensive sample size and across diverse educational contexts, to bolster the generalizability of these findings. Future studies could delve into the enduring effects of integrating the CIPP model into teacher training programs, with a particular focus on its impact on student outcomes.

In conclusion, this research contributes meaningful insights into the applicability and effectiveness of the CIPP evaluation model specifically within the context of vocational high school counseling programs. The implications of the findings extend to educational policymakers, administrators, and practitioners, offering valuable considerations for adopting the CIPP model in program evaluation and professional development initiatives within the field of guidance and counseling. Additionally, the study provides a foundation for theoretical advancements and suggests avenues for future investigations, thereby enriching the understanding of this particular field.

**REFERENCE**

Arjaya, I. B. A., & Suma, K. (2023). Problems of biology learning and evaluation analysis at the cipp model-based higher education level. *Biosfer*, *16*(1), 152–167. https://doi.org/10.21009/biosferjpb.26835

Barber, C., Van Der Vleuten, C., Leppink, J., & Chahine, S. (2020). Social Accountability Frameworks and Their Implications for Medical Education and Program Evaluation: A Narrative Review. In *Academic Medicine* (Vol. 95, Issue 12, pp. 1945–1954). Lippincott Williams and Wilkins. https://doi.org/10.1097/ACM.0000000000003731

Bennett, E. E., & McWhorter, R. R. (2021). Virtual HRD’s Role in Crisis and the Post Covid-19 Professional Lifeworld: Accelerating Skills for Digital Transformation. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, *23*(1), 5–25. https://doi.org/10.1177/1523422320973288

Berman, S., Chaffee, S., & Sarmiento, J. (2018). *The Practice Base For How We Learn Supporting Students’ Social, Emotional, and Academic Development Consensus Statements of Practice From the Council of Distinguished Educators National Commission on Social, Emotional, and Academic Development The Aspen Institute*. www.aspenSEAD.org

Birgili, B., & Kırkıç, K. A. (2021). Evaluation of a Strategic Management Program: Context, Input, Process, Product Model as a Prototype for Business Academies. *TEM Journal*, *10*(1), 204–214. https://doi.org/10.18421/TEM101-26

Bolton-King, R. S. (2022). Student mentoring to enhance graduates’ employability potential. *Science and Justice*, *62*(6), 785–794. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scijus.2022.04.010

Darling-Hammond, L., & Cook-Harvey, C. M. (n.d.). *Educating the Whole Child: Improving School Climate to Support Student Success*. https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/educating-whole-child.

Doufexi, T., & Pampouri, A. (2022). Evaluation of employees’ vocational training programmes and professional development: A case study in Greece. *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education*, *28*(1), 49–72. https://doi.org/10.1177/1477971420979724

Finney, T. L. (2019). SPECIAL SECTION ON QUANTITATIVE PROGRAM EVALUATION: Confirmative Evaluation: New CIPP Evaluation Model. *Journal of Modern Applied Statistical Methods*, *18*(2), 2–24. https://doi.org/10.22237/jmasm/1598889893

Finney, T. L. (2020). *Confirmative Evaluation - A New Cipp Model*. https://digitalcommons.wayne.edu/oa\_dissertations/2485

Iqbal, Z., Anees, M., Khan, R., Wadood, A., & Malik, S. (2021). A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE EFFICACY OF THREE PROGRAM-EVALUATION MODELS –A REVIEW ON THEIR IMPLICATION IN EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, *9*(3), 326–336. https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2021.9333

Kang, S. P., Chen, Y., Svihla, V., Gallup, A., Ferris, K., & Datye, A. K. (2022). Guiding change in higher education: an emergent, iterative application of Kotter’s change model. *Studies in Higher Education*, *47*(2), 270–289. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2020.1741540

Kapur, R. (2018). *Factors Influencing the Students Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in India Factors Influencing the Student’s Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in India*. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324819919

Mujiyati, M., Mayasari, S., & Adiputra, S. (2020). A Comparison of Accountability Models in School Counseling Programs. *Konselor*, *9*(3). https://doi.org/10.24036/0202093110561-0-00

O’Doherty, D., Dromey, M., Lougheed, J., Hannigan, A., Last, J., & McGrath, D. (2018). Barriers and solutions to online learning in medical education - An integrative review. In *BMC Medical Education* (Vol. 18, Issue 1). BioMed Central Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-018-1240-0

Pujiastuti, P., Herwin, H., & Firdaus, F. M. (2021). Thematic learning during the pandemic: CIPP evaluation study. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, *16*(6), 2970–2980. https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v16i6.6481

Rapanta, C., Botturi, L., Goodyear, P., Guàrdia, L., & Koole, M. (2020). Online University Teaching During and After the Covid-19 Crisis: Refocusing Teacher Presence and Learning Activity. *Postdigital Science and Education*, *2*(3), 923–945. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42438-020-00155-y

Riyad, M., Abdullah, T., & Retnowati, R. (n.d.). Measuring the Professionality of School Teachers’ Performance: The Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) Model. In *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change. www.ijicc.net* (Vol. 12). www.ijicc.net

Sankaran, S., & Saad, N. (2022). Evaluating the Bachelor of Education Program Based on the Context, Input, Process, and Product Model. *Frontiers in Education*, *7*. https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374

Shu, L., Yanbin, Z., Ka, C., Zakariah, S. H., Md Ali, N., & Sukardi, S. (2023). The Establishment of Career Development and Employment Guidance Course Evaluation System based on CIPP Model. *Journal of Technology and Humanities*, *4*(1), 41–48. https://doi.org/10.53797/jthkkss.v4i1.5.2023

Strayhorn, T. L. (2018). College Students’ Sense of Belonging. In *College Students’ Sense of Belonging*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315297293

Sugiyo. (2018). *Evaluation Models of Guidance and Counseling Service Based CIPP in Senior High School*.

van der Zanden, P. J. A. C., Denessen, E., Cillessen, A. H. N., & Meijer, P. C. (2018). Domains and predictors of first-year student success: A systematic review. In *Educational Research Review* (Vol. 23, pp. 57–77). Elsevier Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2018.01.001

Wyner, J. (2014). *Excellent Community Colleges Federal Reserve Bank of Boston Community College Convening*.