

THE ASPECTS OF HINDUISM IN POE’S TALES, “LIGEIA” AND “MORELLA”: A STUDY OF REINCARNATION

Sumayah

University Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta, Indonesia

Email: sum207@ums.ac.id

Article history:

Submitted February 04, 2023

Revised May 29, 2023

Accepted June 22, 2023

Published June 27, 2023

ABSTRACT

This study is an attempt to discuss (1) what Hinduism is. (2) what the concept of reincarnation is. (3) what aspects of Hinduism reflected in Poe’s tales “Ligeia” and “Morella”. This study used American Studies theory that is the reconciliation of time (past, present, future), of space and of academic disciplines that are philosophical, historical, and literary approaches. The literary approach used, in this case, is the expressive one. The method applied in this study is analytical descriptive that utilizes library research and concentrates the attention on reference sources related to the topic discussed. The Result of the study shows that there are the aspects of Hinduism namely the wandering spirit and the reincarnation. In Poe’s tales, “Ligeia” and “Morella” the wandering spirit happens when they died. Ligeia, the main character reincarnate into Rowena and Rowena becomes Ligeia again. Morella reincarnates into her baby, Morella. It is the same name.

Keywords: *hinduism, romanticism, death, reincarnation, spirit*

INTRODUCTION

The author appreciates Edgar Allan Poe and his writings, as well as romantic notions. The writer is drawn to romantic notions since they touch on the more inward aspects of human existence and have a significant impact on American culture. The majority of American literature in the first half of the 19th century was influenced by romantic notions. Both domestic and foreign influences contributed to American romanticism. It developed in Europe. In England, romanticism first emerged around the end of the 17th century. Romanticism is an attitude toward the facts of human nature and society rather than a structured system (Bradley, 1962: 334).

In the United States, the authors' attitudes had been shaped by the New World environment and concepts from the European romantic tradition. Romanticism produces abundant literary works with a lot of variation among the authors in every country. The same thing took place in the United States of America. Despite the diversity of the romantic writers' works, the romantics shared certain common traits. They were moral zeal, individualism values, intuitive vision, and the assumption that society is a source of corruption and the natural world is a source of righteousness (Michael, 1985: 263).

Until the Civil War, American politics, art, and philosophy were clearly influenced by romantic ideals. Because of romantic notions that emphasized individualism, the American Revolution happened (Bradley: 334). The romantics rebelled against the rigid conventions of classical art in their works of art. They valued freedom over formality. They disapproved of reason as well. Because of those ideas, the romantics rebelled towards classicism.

One of the great romantic writers was Edgar Allan Poe (1809–1849). He was genius. Commonly, people think of him as a character who may have appeared in his tales or stories and poems that were mysterious, strange and wild. Unusualness certainly appears in some of his works. To suppose that his stories simply used biographically in his peculiar way of life is not wise.

Poe produced a lot of works. He wrote articles, poetry, tales, short stories, and sketches. Poe was a worshiper of beauty. The poem demonstrates Poe's exceptional literary talent. He always used a beautiful woman as his subject, and his poems always featured rhythm and melody (Bayn et al., 1979: 1467-1463). Despite not being a musician, Poe calculated the music that appeared as the result of rhyme and rhythm. George Bernard Shaw said, “...But Poe for all his virtuosity is always a poet and never mere a virtuoso...his poems always have the universe as backgrounds (Shaw in Carlson, 1970: 99).

Poe had a fantastic imagination that allowed him to write fantastic stories of horror. He played the detective in the story as founding father. His strong imagination combined with his depressed feelings. Because of the deaths

of his beloved mother, his friend, and his wife in his life, led to the creation of highly regarded literary works like "The Raven," "Annabel Lee," "Ligeia," "Morella," "The Bells," and others. As the father of detective story, several of Poe's literary creations, especially tales were full of horror and mystery.

There are six previous studies on Poe’s tales, “Ligeia” and “Morella” that are used to support this research. The first is from Sumayah (2016) entitled "Poe's Perspective of Beauty as reflected In Ligeia”. It discussed the main character, Ligeia, as the symbol of beauty of knowledge.

Second is conducted by Elena Anastasaki (2014) in her research entitled “Embedded and Embodied Poetry in Edgar Allan Poe’s “Ligeia” and “The Fall of the House of Usher”. The researcher hopes to demonstrate that, while appearing obscure, the poems have a significant dual purpose in the narrative. They provide the reader with a clue to understanding the enigmatic lyrical people who say them in terms of content. In order to strengthen the sense of inevitableness in the outcome of the related tales, the researcher tries to demonstrate that poetic speech is appropriate here offered as a source of seriousness and authority. Including a distracting narrative element with the intention of seizing the reader's attention semantically, contrasts with Poe's exacting compositional style and gives the stories a significant importance. This study shows that the first four stanzas of "The Haunted Palace" describe the wealth When Roderick Usher was a prince of the kingdom in the past, still in control of his mind, while the last two describe the decline into madness. The poem by Ligeia also has a small imbalance, with the "conqueror worm" incident appearing in the fourth of the poem's five stanzas. The rhyme pattern in both poems is ABABCDCD. This little break in poetical symmetry is a sign that something is off; in Usher's instance, it indicates the imbalance in his mental abilities and in Ligeia’s case, it symbolizes her exaggerated fear of dying, which causes her to become paralyzed.

The third previous study is from Pie-yun Chen (2018) in her research entitled “The Ethical Aspect of Disease: Poe’s “Morella” and *Life*”. The result of

the study show that this essay makes an effort to construct an alternate reading of Poe that takes into account the concept of life and the ethical side of disease. Despite their remarkable readings, the researcher contends that many Poe readers interpret "illness" negatively and may therefore fail to notice the lessons contained in the author's stories. The story of "Morella" represents a return to life, yet that which returns provides a new way of existence and is difference rather than identity. In order to adapt to this new way of existence, one must learn to view life differently, recognize the non-individual aspects of oneself, actively engage with vitality, and eventually come to the realization that life is unending and impersonal.

The fourth previous study is conducted by Ufuk Gundogan (2021) in her publication entitled “EDGAR ALLAN POE’S “HIDEOUS DRAMA OF REVIVIFICATION”: RESURRECTING HIS MOTHER IN FEMALE VAMPIRES”. This paper tries to analyze Edgar Allan Poe’s fiction and poems from a psychoanalytic perspective, focuses on Poe’s short stories “Berenice”, “Ligeia”, “Morella”, and “The Fall of the House of Usher”. The study shows Poe made a name for himself as the ideal Romantic author. The repetition of female vampires reveals Poe's compulsive need to reconnect with his beloved women throughout his writings, which are rife with incest, sadomasochism, and necrophilia. His passionate yearning to bring his beloved wife and mother figures back to life finally caused "repressed" urges in his unconscious to "resurface." Among many others, these desires can be seen in the undead representations of Annabel Lee, Ligeia, Morella, Madeline Usher, or Berenice. Poe investigates the nature of death in relation to life and women because he finds it difficult to let go of the dead. Poe was obliged to investigate the undiscovered connection between death and love in the forms of his female vampires as a result of his unrelenting attachment and fascination with the beautiful undead woman.

The fifth previous study is entitled *The Uncanny as the Intrasubjectivity in the mother: Edgar Allan Poe’s “Morella”* by Pelin Dogan (2021). Using

Freudian concepts as a framework, this study examines how the experience of the uncanny contributed to the deepening of mystery in Edgar Allan Poe's short story "Morella." This essay will examine the ways in which Poe uses the psychodynamics of the characters which are affected by the mother, death, and the uncanny. This makes Poesque literature characteristics in the sense that it is characterized by stories of terror, mystery, the macabre and morbid imagery; the sensation of the uncanny is a crucial component of a plot that features semantic gaps and narrative breaks. In order to analyze the psychodynamics of characters operating within the context of the Freudian eerie, which has not gotten enough scholarly attention from psychoanalytic circles, this study tries to create a place for discourse.

The sixth previous study is a study about Reincarnation in Fiction, conducted by Lorenz Nigst (2019) in his study entitled "Druze Reincarnation in Fiction: Anis Yahya Novel *Jasad kana li* as a Source for Literary Anthropology". According to the Druze worldview, every human soul experiences multiple lifecycles as various human beings. If one of these people passes away, the soul moves right away into the body of a newborn baby. This study demonstrates how this elevates the novel to the status of a crucial resource for anthropological studies into Druze conceptions of transmigration. As a result, this study shows a deeper comprehension of the social and discursive presence of transmigration and "speaking" in Druze contexts is made possible by the novel, which (Anastasaki, 2013/2014) (Nigst, 2019) thematic aspect of the work appears to require anthropological inquiry.

The previous research showed that there was no discussion on "Ligeia and Morella" seen from Hinduism. Thus, this research is different from the others. The research is aimed to analyze "Ligeia" and "Morella" connected to Hindu reincarnation.

THEORY AND METHOD

Many Americans of this era were inclined toward New England transcendentalism. It is an idea that values superiority of perception, conscience, and people's capacity for truth-seeking and intuitive knowledge acquisition (Michael: 263).

Literature was no longer employed as a vehicle for politics, religion, or education throughout the romantic era. Imaginative literature flourished and grew because the writer was considered a researcher rather than an artist who had to follow rigorous classical rules, the writing environment was productive. (264). The author had the freedom to share his thought and feeling about his society. The desire to withdraw from society and return to nature which became a convention of American literature was another aspect of romanticism. James Fenimore Cooper's *Leatherstocking Tales*, Henry David Thoreau's *Walden*, and Mark Twain's *Huckleberry Finn* all addressed it. They were all written in the nineteenth century. In addition, authors from the 20th century like Hemingway and William Faulkner used these traits in their writing. Mystery, isolated locations, horror, and superstition were favorites of the romantics. In their writings, Poe, Hawthorne, and Melville mirrored them. Additionally, they were drawn to primitivism (264-265).

This study used the American Studies theory, which integrates philosophical, historical, and literary perspectives with the concepts of time (past, present, and future), space, and academic discipline. In this case, the literary aspect utilized was an expressive one. The research methodology used in this study was analytical descriptive which focused on reference materials relating to the subject. As mental evidences, "Ligeia" and "Morella" were predominantly used to gather the data. Additional evidences were gathered from journals and books connecting to the subject discussed.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Poe’s lived in Romantic Era. The characteristics of Romantic literary works reflect strong imagination, mystery, remote place, horror, natural beauty, feeling, primitivism, love, etc. The result of the study showed that “Ligeia” and “Morella” reflects remote place. It can be understood that the place consists of area and ideas. The area is far away from America physically and the ideas or teachings are also far away from America ideologically. In this case The remote place can be understood as India with Hindu ideas or teachings. One of them is reincarnation.

1.1 Hinduism

Hinduism, also known as polytheism, means that it worships many gods but it is actually monotheism. Hindus believe in one Supreme God called Brahman, the Most High. Brahman is called Nirguna. Nirguna is described without any attributes (Kingsland, 1997:17).

Everyone has his own opinion. He also worships a separate personal deity. These deities are described as being Saguna. Unlike Nirguna, Saguna has attributes or characteristics (17).

Hindus can choose their gods freely and are not rigid in their choices because different gods have different attributes and functions. It means that they can use based on certain occasion or need. Ganesha is depicted as the Elephant-headed God of wisdom. Ganesha is in charge of removing obstacles. The devotee always calls Ganesha when he is about to start a new business or work. Lakshmi, as the Goddess of wealth, bestows wealth. Saraswati is the Goddess of knowledge. These gods are believed to be the embodiment of Brahman.

The rich Hindu imagination gives shape to aspects of the mind. The appearance of reality is described with a very fantastic and rich depiction. Trimurti is three images or material forms that symbolize the three aspects that exist in Brahman.

These three important aspects can never be described by the reality. The aspect of creation is symbolized by Brahma, as the first member of the Trinity. Then the maintenance aspect is symbolized by Vishnu who is the second member. The last one is Mahesh who is better known as Shiva as the perfecting or destroying aspect (18).

The depiction of Brahman, the One God, as the three main gods has distinctive symbols and attributes. Each is different from one another but still works together. Brahma, Vishnu and Shiva have their own duties.

1.2 Reincarnation

For Hindus, religion serves primarily as a tool for enhancing their presence in the world, rather than as an alternative to it. Hindus hold that person's past behaviors have a lasting impact on the circumstances of their reincarnation. Every incarnation offers the chance to experience a better birth and greater varna (category) only if they have been dharmic (righteous) and this is likely to happen. When one fulfills his own obligations in the right or prescribed way, righteousness will happen.

Karma is a crucial idea to understand this situation. It is identical with the results of any action, whether it is right or wrong. In the sense that it is typically understood in the West, there is no such thing as guilt or sin. Instead, the idea of karma is a comprehension of the vast cycle of consequences that circles around to the initiator of action. Everyone must receive responsibility for his own conduct (46).

There are three types of karma. First, karma which has already started to produce fruits in life. Regarding these current implications, not much can be done. The implications must be borne or relished. Such karma might help to explain why bad people often seem to have good fate while good ones struggle for problems.

Second, there is karma in the developing, and its results will have an impact on the future. Last, there is karma that has built up but hasn't been

released. By taking prompt action, such hidden impacts may be mitigated or neutralized. Ritual prayers are one approach among several available to accomplish this (46).

Sometimes the word "atma" is mistranslated as "soul." The word "atma" is derived from a Rig-Vedic term for "breath" (one of the Vedas). Later on, this gave rise to the idea of a "higher self" (paramatma), which is the same as Brahman—the Supreme Being, the One without a twin, the Singularity.

The human personality is said to have several facets, according to conventional wisdom. It is frequently thought to consist of seven koshas (succeeding facets which include the physical organism, bioenergetic, process and mental states). A complex standing wave of physical components makes up the physical organism. Death (mrta) results when the bioenergetic mechanisms are unable to support the physical body. However, the embodied history, also known as *sanskaras* meaning memory building, is kept. This causes reincarnation repeatedly in order to complete karmas and complete the cycle of impacts. Thus, until a person reaches moksha, the great cycle of birth and death continues (47).

1.3 .Ligeia

The author will evaluate the heroin in this chapter, Ligeia related to Hindu Reincarnation. Ligeia's Reincarnation happened when she is dying. It is one of Poe's stories, "Ligeia." Given that the heroine is a vampire, it might be characterized as a horror fiction. According to DH Lawrence, it is both a horrifying tale of the human soul in its turbulent throes and a love story. (Lawrence, 1952:1: 74). The story of the soul's transition from the first wife to the second is told in "Ligeia." From the narrator's or first person's perspective, the story continues. There are two main characters: Rowena and Ligeia. They are the wives of the narrator. The narrator wedded Rowena after Ligeia died. Rowena passed away two months after getting married.

Poe's story is for the most part can be categorized as a Gothic tale. Yet they are fairly unique in light of the fact that the wellspring of fear rises up out of Poe's spirit. Poe struggled against physical death to attain, as he put it, "an absoluteness of freshness," and he believed that the dread in his Gothic tales came from the lonely depths of his own mind rather than from Germany, according to Charlest L. Sanford. (Sanford in Carlson, 1970: 299).

The different interpretations underlied in view of Poe's biography additionally emerged. Princess Marie Bonaparte was a student of Freud. Based on her opinion, the characters were the real persons in the tale. Husband was Poe. Lady Ligeia was Elizabeth Arnold (Poe’s mother). Lady Rowena was Virginia Clemn (Poe.s wife) and Frances Allen (Poe.s foster mother) (Bonaparte in Barbour and Quirk, 1986: 175).

Another viewpoint came from essayist Edmund Wilson, who saw Poe as a "bridge" between early 19th-century romanticism and late 19th-century symbolism. Wilson claimed that Ligeia was Virginia Clemn and Rowena was Poe's lover (Wilson in Carelson: 148). Poe actually had a lot of women he loved. The women Poe fell in love were Elmira Royster Shelton, Sarah Helen Whitman, Mrs. Annie Richmond, and Mrs. Frances S. Osgood (Peithman, 1986: xi-xii).

Following back to the history of Poe, he was an orphan and "Ligeia" was distributed in 1836. In any case, the writer has a different view. Lady Ligeia is Poe's own mother and Rowena is Virginia Clemn. At the point when he was a kid, Poe did not see her mother yet he heard that her mom had ability as an entertainer. Ligeia was the ideal mother and lady he missed.

The story started when the narator let the reader know that he didn't recall whenever he first stayed in contact with Ligeia, his better half, however he made certain about the spot. It was in some huge rotting city close to the Rhine. Rhine is river in Europe, ascending in eastern Switzerland and streaming around 820 miles for the most part north through West Germany and Netherland toward the North Ocean by means of the Ijseel, Lek and Waal rivers

(Morris, 1981: 1114). After Ligeia was dead, the narrator moved to a monastery in some distant area of Britain.

Poe was an American and a romantic writer. He chose the Rhine and a monastery in Britain as the settings. Poe created new universes in order for readers to concentrate entirely on the issues or setting that he infused into his stories, preventing them from generally being diverted by connections to modern ideas. Poe believed that the best work might be found in a realm that was distinct from this one and that in order to create the realm, ambiguity and doubt were crucial to push the reader away from the mundane and toward the ideal and the beautiful. (<http://www.cliffnotes.com/wileycda/litnote/id>).

Ligeia and the storyteller were a married couple and adored one another but she loved greater to his husband. The storyteller wouldn't even play with the possibility of asking her family's name since he was so dazzled by her language that was extremely melodic. It very well may be seen from.

“Buried in studies of a nature and finally the wife of my bosom.”

(Poe in Auden, 1950: 22).

In reality, it is socially unusual for a man or lady who has no idea about the spouse's family name. Ligeia should be a special woman since her husband dedicates her. Poe frequently didn't name his characters or storytellers. For a romantic author, like Poe, the stress of writing should be the last impact and the pictures delivered subsequently.

(<http://www..cliffnotes.com/wileycda/litnote/id>).

In the following story, the storyteller discussed Ligeia. She was exceptionally rich. She was portrayed as a vampire strolling without voice or as an extremely light thing. It tends to be seen from the citation as follow,

“I would be vain...my shoulder.”(23)

The narrator adores his wife very much her beauty is described completely. It is compared with many artistic things from Greek, India, etc.

Ligeia is compared with Cleopatra. The well of Democritus, Greek goddess, and Lyra.

After describing his wife’s beauty, the narrator tells her illness, she is ill. Ligeia was sick and her husband was discouraged in light of the fact that he realized she would be dead. He had sympathy and strived for her cure; however her effort to live, as a matter of fact, was greater than his effort. Her longing to live was high. It implies that Ligeia's will was major areas of strength for exceptionally. In her withering, Ligeia requested that her husband perused her sonnet which comprised of five stanzas. The sonnet told that life is a calamity, a fight among Humanity and Demise. It was represented the entertainment of heavenly messengers who does not continue on man's purpose though the horrible things of the play make the heavenly messenger pale. Her sonnet showed that she was a capable lady since she composed it.

Poe needed to sanitize the magnificence of information from material nature with the goal that it became profound excellence through rebirth. The tissue of Ligeia was rotted by death. The rest was the soul.

Ligeia returned and reincarnated into Lady Rowena Trevanion of Tremaine as her successor. She was his second spouse. It occurred in the narrator’s psyche which was impacted by opium. The storyteller's brain was not normal. He flew. When Ligeia's soul returned after a long marriage, Rowena passed away. In the Javanese civilization affected by Hinduism, Ligeia's soul is named *roh gentayangan* meaning "drifting soul".

Despite the fact that it is exclusively in storyteller's creative mind, it has a meaning. The extremely amazing will or enthusiasm can not make the dead person quiet. The writer assumes that it reflects Poe’s habit. Hinduism had an impact on Poe since he liked to introduce strange ideas. It was supported by the fact that many American romantic writers were influenced by eastern lessons from China or India. Hinduism acknowledges that a person's soul may rise to a higher or more regrettable in view of the way of behaving during lifetime.

According to Hinduism, the spirit is still alive although the body of the human decays. So, Ligeia dies but her will to live in this world is very strong. Ligeia’s body decomposes but her spirit does not. It is still alive and becomes wandering spirit that follows his husband’s mind. He always remembers and imagines her. It means that her spirit really disturbs him and affects him.

After Ligeia dies, the narrator removes his house and get married again. He marries Rowena who is contradictory to Ligeia. Rowena is very beautiful but the narrator does not love her. Her beauty is only physical. The narrator still imagines his first wife and becomes opium eater although she has a new wife. They marry but the husband does not love her.

Two month after marriage, Rowena is seriously ill. When she is dying Ligeia’s wandering spirit enters in Rowena’s body, then Rowena becomes Ligeia in the narrator’s eyes. It is the reincarnation of Ligeia. Ligeia becomes Rowena and Rowena is really Ligeia in the end of the tale, Ligeia disappears. This is called Moksha. It means that the spirit of Ligeia is free from the cycle of birth and death. It is the ultimate goal of life.

1.4 Morella

In this sub title the writer will explain about the Hindu Reincarnation. The tale of “Morella” is very strange. Poe liked to create tales with the beautiful and clever woman, the heroine and the man adors him. “Morella” describes a man and a woman bound in marriage without the presence of love from the man but the woman love him very much.

First they know each other as friends. The narrator does not love Morella, his wife but they get married. The man appreciates his wife brilliance. Her knowledge is so high and wide that she surpasses her husband’s one. As a wife she loves him very much and she knows that his husband has no love at all for her.

Poe often used sickness to end the heroine’s life. Morella is suddenly sick when she is dying she bears a baby. The husband is very surprised and happy.

According to Hinduism, individuals face rebirth after death and they have chance to be better in the next life and can elevate to the higher stage. It depends on their previous behaviors. The good behaviors will elevate the caste.

In “Morella”, the heroine, Morella is very good and wants very much to be loved by his husband. Though she is independent, she still devotes to his husband and hopes to be paid attention. In fact, the narrator never fulfils what she expects.

Morella is sick and dies and gives her husband a daughter. The husband or the narrator lays her body to the tomb. The baby face is just the same with her mother. The narrator who does not like her mother’s face and does not love her, fall in love with her baby’s face as a father. He names her Morella. Seen from Hindu reincarnation, Morella is successful to get better life after death because she is patient in facing her husband’s behavior. She lives again in the same face and intellect and is loved by her husband. When she lives as the narrator’s wife in the previous stage, she lives without love. It means that the first Morella elevates to the higher stage in the shape of the second Morella or the baby.

The baby grows rapidly and becomes outstanding figure among the girls in her age. When the girl dies the narrator lays in her mother’s tomb. He is very surprised because the body of the first Morella, his wife, disappears.

CONCLUSION

Based on the previous analysis, Poe as a romantic writer reflects remote places in her tales “Ligeia” and “Morella” physically and ideologically. Physically, he mentioned Greek, India, Germany, etc. Ideologically, the remote places can be understood as the remote ideas. In this study, they are Hinduism and its teachings, namely, wandering spirit as the first step and reincarnation as the second step. The steps can be repeatedly until individuals reach Moksha, the end of the life cycle of birth and death

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I am greatly indebted to Prof. DR. Sofyan Anif, the Rector of Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta for his support and give chance to do the research. I wish to extend my deeper gratitude to the leader of the Journal of Haluan Sastra Budaya, UNS. I thank to Abdul Jabbar who always helps me in finishing my articles.

REFERENCES

- Anastasaki, E. (2014). Embedded and embodied poetry in Edgar Allan Poe's : "Ligeia" and "The Fall of the House of Usher". *Connotation: A Journal for Critical Debate*, 208-216.
- Azhar, A., & Yoshiyuki, M. (2010). A Study of 'Kenry' in Japanese and 'Hak' in Indonesian. *Jurnal Humaniora*, 22(1), 22-30.
- Chen, P.Y. (2018). The ethical aspect of disease: Poe's "Morella" and Life. *Concentric: Literary and Cultural Studies*, 44(1), 41-60. DOI: 10.6240/concentric.lit.201803.44(1).0003
- Gundogan, U. (2021). Edgar Allan Poe's "Hideous Drama Of Revivification": Resurrecting His Mother in Female Vampire. *Researchgate*, 11(1), 73-91.
- Lawrence, D.H. (1952). *Studies in classic American literature*. New York: Doubleday & Company Inc.
- McMichel, G.L (210). *Anthology of American literature (Colonial through romantic)*. New York: Mac Millan Publishing Company Inc.
- Michael, G.M. (1967). *Concise anthology of American literature 1865-1914*. New York: Prentis Hall Inc.
- Nigst, L. (2019). Druze reincarnation in fiction: Anis Yahya's Novel *Jasad Kana Li* as source for literary anthropology. *Journal of Arabic and Islamic Studies*, 19(1), 15-34.
- Reid, A. (2008). *Menuju sejarah Sumatra: Antara Indonesia dan dunia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor.
- Smith, & Nash, H., eds. (1960). "Can American Studies Develop A Method" In *Studies in American Culture: Dominant Ideas & Images*. Joseph J. Kwit and Mary C Turphy. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Zacharek, S. (2008). *The New York Times*. Retrieved February 12, 2013, from The New York Times: <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/04/27/books/review/Zacharek>.